## PHYSICAL SECURITY YESTERDAY, TODAY & TOMORROW

**ADVANCED TECHNIQUES FOR SUBSTATION BALLISTIC THREAT ANALYSIS** 

Alan Sowell VP, Project Management POWER Engineers



#### Purpose & Learning Objectives

The purpose of this program is to help attendees gain a better understanding of substation physical security systems and standards.

At the end of this presentation, you will be able to:

- Describe the CIP-014 Physical Security Standard and why it was developed
- Implement current physical security analysis processes and tools
- Describe the future of physical security (threats, requirements & analysis)







#### Metcalf Attack

- April 16, 2013
- Critical Communication
  Lines Cut
- >120 Shots Fired
- 17 Transformers Severely
  Damaged
- **\$15M** in Damages





#### The Problem

**CIP-014-2** - Identify and protect grid assets, that if rendered inoperable or damaged from a physical attack could result in instability, or cascading/catastrophic failure. Protect the critical assets in a substation that may cause a catastrophic failure on the system.







FLORIDA PUBLIC POWER

The material contained in this presentation is the proprietary, trade secret information of POWER Engineers, Inc. No reproduction or other use is permitted without POWER's prior express written consent. © 2021 POWER Engineers, Inc. All rights reserved.





#### **Recent Attacks**



#### Duke

- Rammed Gate
- Shot Transformers
- 45,000 Without Power



#### Tacoma

- 4 Substations Vandalized
- Transformers Damaged
- 14,000 Without Power



#### BGE

- Conspiracy to Attack Multiple Substations
- **1M** Without Power if Successful



#### **Physical Security Systems**

- Ballistic Rated Walls
- Gates
- Ground Radar
- Access Control
- CCTV
- Fence Detection
- Layered Approach



#### Security Cameras and Radar





#### Upgraded Gate & Expanded Metal Fence







#### **Ballistic Walls**







**Transformer Ballistic Wall** 





#### **Transformer Wraps**



SE GP T NP PT 14 Unrestricted © Siemens Energy, 2021



SE GP T NP PT Unrestricted © Siemens Energy,



# Example of Reduced Risk Progress Based on Mitigations Over Time

			Downgraded	Upgraded		
	2016 Assessment		2018 Assessment		2021 Assessment	
System Control Center Threat Vectors	Probability of Success		Probability of Success		Probability of Success	
	Weighting	Ranking	Ranking	Success Prob.	Ranking	Success Prob.
Vehicle Borne Improvised Explosive Device (VBIED)	4.0	Very High	3.0	High	3.0	High
Portable Improvised Explosibe Device (IED)	4.0	Very High	3.0	High	1.0	Low
Forced Entry Attack	2.0	Medium	1.0	Low	1.0	Low
Coordinated Assault	1.0	Low	3.0	High	3.0	High
Sabotage	1.0	Low	1.0	Low	1.0	Low
Small Arms Ballistic Attack	1.0	Low	1.0	Low	1.0	Low
Direct Fire Weapon Ballistic Attack	1.0	Low	1.0	Low	1.0	Low
Asset Theft	1.0	Low	1.0	Low	1.0	Low



#### THE FUTURE



#### Ground Radar, Stereo Cameras and Al





#### Ground Radar with Al





#### **Ground Radar with Al**





#### Ground Radar with Al





#### FLIR Drone Jamming Device













#### A BRUTE FORCE APPROACH TO CIP 14.2 PROTECTION



BALLISTIC WALL

TRANSFORMER BALLISTIC WALL

TRANSFORMER WRAP



#### The Challenge



### Question

*"How can we reduce construction costs for security walls and maintain Physical Security?"* 

### Answer

FLORIDA MUNICIPAL ELECTRIC ASSOCIATIO

"...build only what's needed."

FLORIDA PUBLIC POWER

The material contained in this presentation is the proprietary, trade secret information of POWER Engineers, Inc. No reproduction or other use is permitted without POWER's prior express written consent. © 2021 POWER Engineers, Inc. All rights reserved.

#### **Data Collection**



FLORIDA PUBLIC POWER

FLORIDA MUNICIPAL ELECTRIC ASSOCIATION





- Quality analysis and rapid sharing of security information on how to mitigate complex threats to the grid.
- Occasionally over hundreds of reports of physical attacks per month





#### What does this mean?

- Recent uptick in physical attacks to NON CIP-014 substations
- Subsequent loss in revenue for Utilities/PUCs
- Loss of critical customers (i.e., hospitals, Big Tech)
- Increased likelihood of attacks
- Likely expansion of CIP-014
- Increased priority to protect critical assets
- Increased need for security experts and analysis tools
- Passing along the costs to rate payers?
- Improve communication and awareness of potential threats



#### QUESTIONS





# For Questions on any of the concepts or technologies in this presentation, Contact:

Chris Ott Sr. Project Engineer Physical Security 503-892-6869 Alan Sowell VP, Project Management 770-605-1700









